

Beyond Pesticides • Center for Environmental Health • Citizens Against Chemicals Pollution • ETC Group • Food and Water Watch • Friends of the Earth • GE Free Latin America • Institute for Agriculture and Trade Policy • Madison Environmental Justice Organization • Nanotechnology Citizen Engagement Organization • Oilwatch • The Edmonds Institute • The International Center for Technology Assessment • The Loka Institute • Renanosoma • Toxisphera

May 21, 2010
The Honorable Lisa Jackson
Administrator
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20460

Dear Administrator Jackson:

It has come to our attention that Green Earth Technologies (GET), Inc. is seeking approval from the EPA to disperse a large quantity of manufactured nanoparticles in the Gulf of Mexico, stating that the dispersal would remedy the oil spill recently suffered by the region. The for-profit company claiming to sell “totally green” products created from nanotechnology, wishes to scatter on land and in water its G-Marine Fuel Spill Clean-UP! (NANO Emulsion Technology) Oil Dispersant in areas affected by the BP rig collapse in the Gulf of Mexico.¹

The undersigned public-interest organizations respectfully urge the EPA to deny approval of this and similar projects that seek to release nanoscale chemicals or chemicals measuring less than 300 nanometers into the environment. In this case the company claims their product is composed of particles measuring 1-4nm. Manufactured nanoparticles have been shown to be toxic to humans, mammals, and aquatic life.

We understand the enormous technical and regulatory challenges posed by the oil spill. However, two wrongs do not make a right. Exacerbating this grave situation by allowing GET to add pollutants to contaminated land and water should not be allowed, especially considering that the GET nanoparticles could be impossible to recover once introduced into the environment. We fully oppose this irresponsible, unscientific, and dangerous experiment.

We are not aware at this time of the exact nanoscale particles used in this ‘nano emulsion technology’ because this information is considered a trade secret by the company. Yet, we do know that most chemicals manufactured at the nanoscale hold unique and potentially toxic properties. While some new properties from the nanoscale may seem desirable, materials at this scale can also pose new toxicological risks. Nanoparticles have a very large surface area which typically results in greater chemical reactivity, biological activity and catalytic behavior compared to larger particles of the same chemical composition.² Unfortunately, the greater chemical reactivity and bioavailability of nanomaterials may also result in greater toxicity of nanoparticles compared to the same unit of mass of

larger particles.³ Other properties of manufactured nanomaterials that influence toxicity include: chemical composition, shape, surface structure, surface charge, catalytic behavior, extent of particle aggregation or disaggregation, and the presence or absence of other groups of chemicals attached to the nanomaterials.⁴

There is also clear scientific evidence showing that manufactured nanoparticles can travel up the food chain from smaller to larger organisms, thus allowing the toxic properties of manufactured nanoparticles to take hold in the animal food chain.⁵ Further, studies show that manufactured nanoparticles could damage important microbes in the environment, which could impact microbes that are helpful to ecosystems and sewage treatment plants.⁶ Evidence of nanoparticle harm to fish and invertebrates at low concentrations has also been reported in scientific literature,⁷ as have exotoxic effects on microbes and plants.⁸

Specifically, manufactured nanoparticles have been shown to be toxic to aquatic life such as zebrafish,⁹ daphnia,¹⁰ algae,¹¹ invertebrates,¹² and rainbow trout.¹³ Some have shown to be toxic to earthworms¹⁴ and important food crops.¹⁵ Some nanoparticles have even been found to damage DNA and cause mutations.¹⁶

When potential problems of such consequence have been reported in scientific literature, a precautionary approach to the widespread dispersal of these manufactured particles would seem to be the natural response.

We trust EPA will oppose this project and will seek instead truly environmentally safe methods for oil clean-up in the Gulf.

Respectfully submitted,

Elizabeth Bravo
GE Free Latin America

Beth Burrows
The Edmonds Institute

Jaydee Hanson
International Center for Technology Assessment

Nichelle Harriott
Beyond Pesticides

Ian Illuminato
Friends of the Earth

Charles Margulis
Center for Environmental Health

Paulo Roberto Martins
Renanosoma

Pat Mooney
ETC Group

Zuleica Nycz
Toxisphera

Maria Powell
**Madison Environmental Justice Organization and
Nanotechnology Citizen Engagement Organization**

Ivonne Yanez
Oilwatch Sudamerica

Tim Schwab
Food and Water Watch

Steve Suppan
Institute for Agriculture and Trade Policy

Richard Worthington
Loka Institute

Takeshi Yasuma
Citizens Against Chemicals Pollution

**Please send responses to: Ian Illuminato, Friends of the Earth, 1100 15th Street NW, 11th floor,
Washington DC 20005 iilluminato@foe.org, +1 250-478-7135**

¹ See Green Earth Technologies, G.E.T. RESPONSE - Gulf Oil Spill:
<http://www.getg.com/docs/G.E.T.%20RESPONSE%20GULF%20OIL%20PILL.pdf>.

² Garnett M., and Kallinteri P. (2006). "Nanomedicines and nanotoxicology: some physiological principles." *Occupational Medicine* 56: 307-311;
Limbach L., Wick P., Manser P., Grass R., Bruinink A., Stark W. (2007). "Exposure of engineered nanoparticles to human lung epithelial cells: Influence of chemical composition and catalytic activity on oxidative stress." *Environmental Science & Technology* 41: 4158-4163;
Nel A., Xia T., Li N. (2006). Toxic potential of materials at the nanolevel." *Science* 311: 622-627.

³ Hoet P., Bruske-Holfeld I., and Salata O. (2004). "Nanoparticles – known and unknown health risks." *J Nanobiotechnology* 2: 12;
Oberdörster G., Maynard A., Donaldson K., Castranova V., Fitzpatrick J., Ausman K., Carter J., Karn B., Kreyling W., Lai D., Olin S., Monteiro-Riviere N., Warheit D., Yang H. (2005a). "Principles for characterising the potential human health effects from exposure to nanomaterials: elements of a screening strategy." *Particle Fibre Toxicology* 2:8;
Oberdörster G., Oberdörster E., Oberdörster J. (2005b). "Nanotoxicology: an emerging discipline from studies of ultrafine particles." *Environmental Health Perspectives* 113(7): 823-839.

-
- ⁴ Brunner, T., Piusmanser, P., Spohn, P., Grass, R., Limbach, L., Bruinink, A., Stark, W. (2006). "In Vitro Cytotoxicity of Oxide Nanoparticles: Comparison to Asbestos, Silica, and the Effect of Particle Solubility." *Environmental Science Technology* 40: 4374-4381;
- Magrez A., Kasa S., Salicio V., Pasquier N., Won Seo J., Celio M., Catsicas S., Schwaller B., Forro L. (2006). "Cellular toxicity of carbon-based nanomaterials." *Nano Letters* 6(6): 1121-1125;
- Sayes C., Fortner J., Guo W., Lyon D., Boyd A., Ausman K., Tao Y., Sitharaman B., Wilson L., Hughes J., West J., Colvin V. (2004). "The differential cytotoxicity of water-soluble Fullerenes." *Nanoletters* 4: 1881-1887;
- Sayes C., Wahi R., Kurian P., Liu Y., West J., Ausman K., Warheit D., Colvin V. (2006). "Correlating nanoscale titania structure with toxicity: A cytotoxicity and inflammatory response study with human dermal fibroblasts and human lung epithelial cells." *Toxicological Science* 92(1): 174-185.
- ⁵ Zhu X., Wang J., Zhang X., Chang Y., Chen Y. (2010). "Trophic transfer of TiO₂ nanoparticles from daphnia to zebrafish in a simplified freshwater food chain." *Chemosphere* 79(9): 928-933.
- ⁶ See Environmental Health News: <http://www.environmentalhealthnews.org/ehs/news/nanoparticles-damage-microbes>.
- ⁷ Handy R.D., et al. (2008). "Ecotoxicology of nanoparticles and nanomaterials: current status, knowledge gaps, challenges, and future needs." *Ecotoxicology* 17(4): 315-325;
- Handy R.D. et al. (2008). "The ecotoxicology and chemistry of manufactured nanoparticles." *Ecotoxicology* 17(4): 278-314;
- Ferry J.L., et al. (2009). "Transfer of gold nanoparticles from the water column to the estuarine food Web." *Nat Nanotechnol.* 4(7): 441-4.
- ⁸ Boxall A.B., Tiede K., Chaudhry Q. (2007). "Engineered nanomaterials in soils and water: how do they behave and could they pose a risk to human health?." *Nanomedicine* 2(6): 919-27.
- ⁹ Zhu X., Wang J., Zhang X., Chang Y., Chen Y. (2009). "The impact of ZnO nanoparticle aggregates on the embryonic development of zebrafish (*Danio rerio*)." *Nanotechnology* 20(19): 195103 (9 pp);
- Bar-Ilan O., Albrecht RM., Fako VE., Furgeson DY. (2009). "Toxicity Assessments of Multisized Gold and Silver Nanoparticles in Zebrafish Embryos." *Small* 5(16): 1897-1910.
- ¹⁰ Zhu X., Zhu L., Chen Y., Tian S. (2009). "Acute toxicities of six manufactured nanomaterial suspensions to *Daphnia magna*." *Journal of Nanoparticle Research* 11(1): 65-75;
- Zhu X., Chang Y., Chen Y. (2010). "Toxicity and bioaccumulation of TiO₂ nanoparticle aggregates in *Daphnia magna*." *Chemosphere*, 78(3): 209-215.
- ¹¹ Aruoja V., Dubourguier H.C., Kasemets K., Kahru A. (2009). "Toxicity of nanoparticles of CuO, ZnO and TiO₂ to microAlgae *Pseudokirchneriella subcapitata*." *Science of the Total Environment*, 407(4): 1461-1468;
- Hall S., Bradley T., Moore J.T., Kuykindall T., Minella L. (2009). "Acute and chronic toxicity of nano-scale TiO₂ particles to freshwater fish, cladocerans, and green algae, and effects of organic and inorganic substrate on TiO₂ toxicity." *Nanotoxicology*, 3(2): 91-97.
- ¹² Canesi L., Ciacci C., Vallatto D., Gallo G., Marcomini A., Pojana G. (2010). "In vitro effects of suspensions of selected nanoparticles (C60 fullerene, TiO₂, SiO₂) on *Mytilus* hemocytes." *Aquatic Toxicology*, 96(2): 151-158;
- Baun, A.; Hartmann, N.; Grieger, K.; Kusk, K. (2008). "Ecotoxicity of engineered nanoparticles to aquatic invertebrates: a brief review and recommendations for future toxicity testing." *Ecotoxicology* 17: 387-395.
- ¹³ Farkas J., Christian P., Urrea J.A.G., Roos N., Hasselov M., Tollefsen K.E., Thomas K.V. (2010). "Effects of silver and gold nanoparticles on rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) hepatocytes." *Aquatic Toxicology*, 96(1): 44-52.

¹⁴ Scott-Fordsmand, J. J.; Krogh, P. H.; Schaefer, M.; Johansen, A. (2008). "The toxicity testing of double-walled nanotubes-contaminated food to *Eisenia veneta* earthworms." *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*, 71(3): 616-619.

¹⁵ Lin S., et al. (2009). "Uptake, Translocation, and Transmission of Carbon Nanomaterials in Rice Plants." *Small* 5(10): 1128–1132.

¹⁶ Bhabra, G., A. Sood, et al. (2009). "Nanoparticles can cause DNA damage across a cellular barrier." *Nat Nano* 4(12): 876-883;

Geiser M., Rothen-Rutishauser B., Knapp N., Schurch S., Kreyling W., Schulz H., Semmler M., Im H., Heyder J., Gehr P. (2005). "Ultrafine particles cross cellular membranes by non-phagocytic mechanisms in lungs and in cultured cells." *Environ Health Perspect* 113(11): 1555-1560.